









# **Environmental** Scorecard

# **New York City Council**

2015

























































NEW



VORK



## ABOUT NYLCV

The New York League of Conservation Voters, Inc. is the only nonpartisan, statewide environmental organization in New York that takes a pragmatic approach to fighting for clean water, healthy air, renewable energy and open space.

We're effective because we:

- Educate public officials about the steps they should take to improve the environment;
- Evaluate the performance of elected officials; and
- Endorse and elect environmental leaders.

New York League of Conservation Voters 30 Broad Street, 30th Floor New York, NY 10004 Phone 212-361-6350 info@nylcv.org www.nylcv.org



facebook.com/nylcv



twitter.com/nylcv

Marcia Bystryn, President Ya-Ting Liu, New York City Program Director Jordan Levine, Communications Director Mary Kate Sickel, Legislative Intern



## INTRODUCTION

On Earth Day 2015, Mayor de Blasio released "One New York: The Plan for a Strong and Just City," a comprehensive plan for a sustainable and resilient city. OneNYC set ambitious and exciting goals such as: reducing the city's greenhouse gas emissions 80 percent by 2050, sending zero waste to landfills by 2030 and ensuring New York City has the best air quality among all large U.S. cities by 2030. The Council will play a large role in the implementation and oversight of OneNYC. On December 14, 2015, just days after the historic Paris Climate Talks, the Council held its first oversight hearing on the plan. Chaired by the Committees on Environmental Protection and Recovery and Resiliency, the Council applauded the progress to date but also asked for greater specificity on the City's progress in the first of an ongoing series on this topic.

In 2015, the Council, under the steadfast leadership of Speaker Mark-Viverito, initiated a number of significant actions toward a more sustainable city. They passed a comprehensive air code update, the first since 1970; committed to reducing the city-owned vehicle fleet nine percent by 2020; and introduced a new budgetary initiative called "A Greener NYC," which will fund programs related to environmental education, advocacy and green job training.

The Council is making significant strides this year with two environmental justice bills, and hearings are scheduled for late January 2016. The first one will require a study of potential environmental justice communities in NYC and the other will require agencies to develop plans to promote environmental justice policies and actions.

In July, Council Member Costa Constantinides ably took over as chair of the Environmental Protection Committee, succeeding a brief but impressive stint by Council Member Donovan Richards. Council Member Constantinides' dedication to producing strong legislation that aims to reduce greenhouse gas emissions is already apparent: four of his bills are highlighted on our 2015 Scorecard.

We look forward to the one year progress report on OneNYC in April, and we are encouraged by the accomplishments of the Council and the Administration to date. The ambitious goals set out by OneNYC will not come easy or cheap. The City Council plays an important role in ensuring that the city remains a thought leader in sustainability policy and sets aside the necessary resources to get us on a healthier and more sustainable path.



Speaker Mark-Viverito & Council Member Richards touring a pilot for green food carts.

## ABOUT THE BILLS

#### 1. Carryout Bag Bill - Intro 209 (Chin/Lander)\*

This bill would place a 10 cent fee on single use plastic or paper bags at the register, to be collected by each business. The fee can be avoided by not taking a carryout bag or by bringing your own bag. Each year, New Yorkers use 9.7 billion single-use carryout bags. Tax payers shell out \$12 million a year just to truck them to landfills. Bags also pollute surrounding waterways, pose a threat to marine animals, and contaminate the city's recycling streams. The bill was heard by the Committee on Sanitation and Solid Waste Management on November 19, 2014, and is awaiting a vote in committee.



Left: A plastic bag lake in New York City. Right: Children's products found on store shelves in New York that contain toxic chemicals.

2. Child Safe Products - Intro 803 (Mark-Viverito/Richards)\* This bill would prohibit the sale and distribution of children's products containing the chemicals formaldehyde, benzene, lead, mercury, antimony, arsenic, cadmium, or cobalt in New York City. Toxic chemicals threaten children's health. They are known to cause cancer, learning disorders, genetic anomalies, hyperactivity, developmental disorders, asthma, obesity and infertility. This bill would help eliminate harmful chemicals in products that can cause lifelong harm to children. Intro 803 was introduced to the Council on June 10, 2015, and was heard by the Committee on Consumer Affairs on January 14, 2016.

\* Denotes a priority bill for 2015.

#### 3. Microbeads Ban - Intro 928 (Garodnick)\*

This bill would ban the sale of personal care products and over-thecounter drugs that contain microbeads. Over 8 tons of microbeads are washed down drains in New York City each year. These plastics act like sponges for PCBs and other highly toxic chemicals, accumulating them on their surface where they are eventually consumed by marine life. Microbeads, which have natural alternatives such as nut husks and sea salts, are unnecessarily added to cosmetic and personal care products. President Obama signed into law the Microbead -Free Waters Act of 2015 (H.R. 1321) on December 28, 2015. The New York City Council bill, while similar to the federal bill, implements the ban almost two years earlier. Intro 928 was introduced to the Council on September 30, 2015. The Committee on Consumer Affairs heard the bill on October 26, 2015.



Left: Examples of products containing microbeads. Right: Parks, such as St. Mary's in the south Bronx, would benefit from maintenance tracking and more equitably distributed resources.

4. Park Maintenance Tracker - Intro 154 (Lander/Levine) This bill amends the Administrative Code of the City of New York, in relation to an annual report on park maintenance and capital expenditures. This bill provides information regarding the status of capital projects and reports on parks maintenance, which previously was not available. With this information the public will have a better understanding of equitable distribution of resources in the parks system and the process of capital projects. Intro 154 was introduced to the Council on March 12, 2014, and was signed into law by Mayor de Blasio on November 4, 2015.

5. Community Air Quality Surveys - Intro 712 (Johnson) This bill will require the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene to conduct community air quality surveys and publish the results annually. The community air quality surveys will help illustrate major air quality concerns, such as traffic and building emissions, and the data provided informs programs such as the Clean Heat program, the update to the City's air code, and OneNYC. This legislation was introduced to the Council on March 11, 2015, and was signed into law by Mayor de Blasio on November 4, 2015.



Left: Despite advances we have made, we still see problems like smog existing in NYC today. Right: For far too long, low-income communities have had to bear the burden of the worst environmental impacts, both in terms of pollution and the effects of climate change.

6. Identifying Environmental Justice Issues - Intro 886 (Barron) This bill requires agencies to develop plans for promoting environmental justice in their programs, policies, and actions. The bill requires environmental justice planning that promotes enforcement of health and environmental laws; ensures greater public participation; improves research and data collection; and ensures equitable distribution and access to environmental benefits. This bill aims to have environmental burdens assessed throughout the five boroughs and make sure environmental benefits are distributed equitably throughout the city. This bill would be the first of its kind in the country. Into 886 was introduced to the Council on September 17, 2015, and is scheduled for a hearing in January 2016.

#### 7. Geothermal Energy - Intro 609 (Constantinides)

This bill requires an identification of the geothermal types of systems and buildings, including waterfront properties, best served by geothermal energy. The bill also establishes the adoption of rules and registration requirements for persons who design and install geothermal systems. Geothermal heat pumps have the potential to reduce citywide emissions by 2.6%. This legislation was introduced to the Council on January 7, 2015. The bill was signed into law by Mayor de Blasio on January 5, 2016.

#### 8. Clean Heating Oil - Intro 642 (Constantinides)

This bill mandates that any heating oil used in a building in the City must be at least B5 after October 1, 2016, B10 after October 1, 2020, B15 after October 1, 2025, and B20 after October 1, 2030. In 2013, 31 million liters of biofuel were used in NYC buildings as a result of LL43 of 2010, which required all commercial and residential buildings in the City to use B2. The consumption of B2 biofuel blend resulted in greenhouse gas emission reductions equivalent to removing almost 17,700 passenger vehicles from the road. Intro 642 was introduced to the Council on February 12, 2015. The Committee on Environmental Protection heard the bill on October 26, 2015.



Left: A Bronx-based biofuel company makes deliveries to buildings already converted to clean heating oil. Right: The geothermal energy system at the Brooklyn Children's Museum.

9. Right of Way for Pedestrians - Intro 997 (James/Chin) This bill provides the right of way to pedestrians crossing from a median when a numerical countdown clock has already begun to count down. This bill fixes a flawed city rule that says people should not start to cross the street at any point after the pedestrian signal begins flashing red. Police and prosecutors have cited the rule when they avoid applying the city's Right of Way Law to drivers who fail to yield to pedestrians in the crosswalk. Intro 997 would amend the rule to state that pedestrians in the crosswalk "shall have the right of way for the duration of the flashing cycle and vehicular traffic shall yield the right of way to all such pedestrians for as long as the signal remains flashing." Intro 997 was introduced to the Council on November 10, 2015.

10. School Environmental Data Reporting - Intro 126 (Cabrera) This bill requires the Department of Education to report environmental inspections and guarantee the right to access assessment results in a timely fashion. The reports may concern the environmental assessment, investigation or remediation of any public school or any proposed public school, including but not limited to any report on the quality of the air, soil, water, or indoor environment. This bill will ensure that an egregious situation, such as the Bronx New School - where parents and employees were not informed about unsafe contamination levels for over six months, and only notified after the school was shut down - never happens again. This legislation was introduced to the Council on March 12, 2014 and was signed into law by Mayor de Blasio on February 5, 2015.

# 11. LEED Standards for New Construction - Intro 701 (Mark-Viverito/Constantinides)

This bill requires certain capital projects to meet the highest LEED standard. The building energy conservation strategies and protocols embedded in the highest LEED standard are an essential tool to reduce overall building energy use, which is currently about 80% of NYC's carbon emissions. A reduced demand for energy will not only result in cost savings for New York, but reductions in emissions from air pollutants will also lead to cleaner air and better health. This legislation was introduced to the Council on March 11, 2015 and was heard by the Committee on Housing and Buildings on September 25, 2015.

# 12. Solar Technology in City-Owned Buildings - Intro 478 (Constantinides)

This bill requires the Department of Citywide Administrative Services to assess and implement solar technology when feasible in city-owned buildings. This bill allows the city to achieve the OneNYC initiative of removing barriers to a more efficient power generation and increasing renewable power production. This legislation was introduced on September 23, 2014, and re-referred to the Committee on Environmental Protection on December 14, 2015. The Committee on Environmental Protection held a hearing on January 15, 2016.



#### How the Scores are Computed

Council Members earn points by casting pro-environment votes or for co-sponsoring pro-environment bills. Of the 12 pieces of legislation scored this year, three were classified as priority bills and council members' actions were weighted doubly on these. Negative votes and absences counted against the final score. Votes missed due to medical absences, however, were not factored into the score. In the 23rd and 51st districts, Council Members Grodenchick and Borelli filled vacant seats in a November special election. Since they served for less than two months out of the year, we did not grade them in the 2015 Scorecard.



Left: Council Members Treyger and Constantinides leading an oversight hearing on OneNYC in December 2015. Above: NYC is expanding its fleet of electric vehicles to 2,000, the largest in North America.

#### Methodology

The New York League of Conservation Voters (NYLCV) regularly convenes a "Green Group" of New York City's leading environmental, transportation, public health, parks and environmental justice organizations to discuss important issues and formulate collective legislative priorities. NYLCV selected the legislation in this Scorecard after extensive consultation with these partner organizations. From an initial universe of over 70 bills, the final Scorecard bills were pared down to 12. Three of these bills were designated as priority bills and were weighted twice in the final score.

Throughout the Scorecard formulation process, NYLCV was in contact with all 48 council members scored and their staffs, informing them of the bills under consideration and the pro-environment actions we urged them to take.

# Score By Borough

| Brooklyn:      | 87 |
|----------------|----|
| Manhattan:     | 84 |
| Queens:        | 83 |
| Bronx:         | 65 |
| Staten Island: | 57 |
| •              |    |

Average Score: 75



SL Green, the developer of One Vanderbilt, is seeking a LEED Gold Certification.

#### Perfect Score of 100

Bronx - Andrew Cohen, Ritchie Torres Brooklyn - Stephen Levin, Carlos Menchaca Manhattan - Margaret Chin, Corey Johnson, Mark Levine Ydanis Rodriguez, Helen Rosenthal Queens - Costa Constantinides, Elizabeth Crowley Donovan Richards, Jimmy Van Bramer Staten Island - none

#### Low Scores

Rosie Mendez - 53, Vincent Gentile - 47 Fernando Cabrera - 38, Ruben Wills - 38 Andy King - 33, Mathieu Eugene - 27 Darlene Mealy - 27, David Greenfield - 27 Steven Matteo - 27, Inez Dickens - 25 Maria del Carmen Arroyo - 20

## **Scores of Key Committee Chairs**



**Consumer Affairs** Council Member Rafael Espinal Score: 73



**Recovery & Resiliency** Council Member Mark Treyger Score: 87



Environmental Protection Council Member Costa Constantinides Council Member Antonio Reynoso Score: 100



Sanitation & Solid Waste Score: 93



Parks & Recreation Score: 100



**Transportation** Council Member Mark Levine Council Member Ydanis Rodriguez Score: 100

| Key<br>✓ = pro-environment<br>X = anti-environment<br>A = absent<br>M = medical<br>* = priority bill | District | 1. Carryout Bag Bill* | 2. Child Safe Products* | 3. Microbead Ban* | 4. Park Maintenance | 5. Air Quality Survey | 6. Environmental Justice | 7. Geothermal Energy  | 8. Clean Heating Oil | 9. Right of Way | 10. School Data | 11. LEED Standards | 12. Solar Technology | 2015 SCORE |
|--|----------|-----------------------|-------------------------|-------------------|---------------------|-----------------------|--------------------------|-----------------------|----------------------|-----------------|-----------------|--------------------|----------------------|------------|
| Manhattan  |          |                       |                         |                   |                     |                       |                          |                       |                      |                 |                 |                    |                      |            |
| Chin   | 1        | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$            | $\checkmark$      | 1                   | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$             | <ul> <li>✓</li> </ul> | ~                    | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$       | $\checkmark$         | 100        |
| Mendez   | 2        | $\checkmark$          | x                       | x                 | $\checkmark$        | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$             | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$         | x               | $\checkmark$    | x                  | х                    | 53         |
| Johnson  | 3        | ~                     | ~                       | $\checkmark$      | ~                   | $\checkmark$          | ~                        | ~                     | ~                    | ~               | ~               | ~                  | $\checkmark$         | 100        |
| Garodnick  | 4        | x                     | $\checkmark$            | $\checkmark$      | ~                   | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$             | ~                     | $\checkmark$         | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$       | $\checkmark$         | 87         |
| Kallos   | 5        | ~                     | ~                       | ~                 | ~                   | ~                     | x                        | ~                     | ~                    | ~               | 1               | ~                  | $\checkmark$         | 93         |
| Rosenthal  | 6        | ~                     | $\checkmark$            | ~                 | ~                   | ~                     | $\checkmark$             | ~                     | $\checkmark$         | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$    | ~                  | $\checkmark$         | 100        |
| Levine   | 7        | ~                     | ~                       | $\checkmark$      | 1                   | ~                     | ~                        | 1                     | ~                    | ~               | ~               | ~                  | $\checkmark$         | 100        |
| Dickens  | 9        | x                     | x                       | $\checkmark$      | м                   | м                     | x                        | м                     | x                    | x               | $\checkmark$    | x                  | ×                    | 25         |
| Rodriguez  | 10       | ~                     | ~                       | ~                 | $\checkmark$        | $\checkmark$          | ~                        | ~                     | ~                    | ~               | ~               | $\checkmark$       | $\checkmark$         | 100        |
| Bronx  |          |                       |                         |                   |                     |                       |                          |                       |                      |                 |                 |                    |                      |            |
| Cohen  | 11       | $\checkmark$          | ~                       | ~                 | ~                   | ~                     | ~                        | ~                     | $\checkmark$         | ~               | 1               | ~                  | $\checkmark$         | 100        |
| King   | 12       | х                     | x                       | x                 | $\checkmark$        | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$             | $\checkmark$          | x                    | x               | A               | x                  | $\checkmark$         | 33         |
| Vacca  | 13       | х                     | $\checkmark$            | ~                 | ~                   | ~                     | x                        | ~                     | $\checkmark$         | ~               | ~               | $\checkmark$       | $\checkmark$         | 80         |
| Cabrera  | 14       | х                     | x                       | $\checkmark$      | м                   | м                     | $\checkmark$             | $\checkmark$          | x                    | x               | $\checkmark$    | x                  | ×                    | 38         |
| Torres   | 15       | $\checkmark$          | 1                       | ~                 | 1                   | 1                     | ~                        | ~                     | $\checkmark$         | ~               | ~               | $\checkmark$       | $\checkmark$         | 100        |
| Gibson   | 16       | х                     | $\checkmark$            | x                 | $\checkmark$        | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$             | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$         | x               | $\checkmark$    | x                  | $\checkmark$         | 60         |
| Arroyo   | 17       | х                     | x                       | x                 | ~                   | ~                     | x                        | A                     | x                    | x               | 1               | x                  | х                    | 20         |
| Palma  | 18       | х                     | $\checkmark$            | $\checkmark$      | $\checkmark$        | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$             | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$         | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$       | $\checkmark$         | 86         |
| Queens   |          |                       |                         |                   |                     |                       |                          |                       |                      |                 |                 |                    |                      |            |
| Vallone  | 19       | x                     | $\checkmark$            | ~                 | 1                   | ~                     | $\checkmark$             | x                     | $\checkmark$         | 1               | ~               | $\checkmark$       | $\checkmark$         | 80         |
| Koo  | 20       | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$            | ~                 | ~                   | ~                     | x                        | ~                     | $\checkmark$         | ~               | 1               | x                  | $\checkmark$         | 87         |
| Ferreras   | 21       | x                     | $\checkmark$            | $\checkmark$      | ~                   | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$             | ~                     | $\checkmark$         | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$       | $\checkmark$         | 87         |
| Constantinides   | 22       | ~                     | $\checkmark$            | ~                 | ~                   | ~                     | ~                        | ~                     | $\checkmark$         | ~               | ~               | ~                  | $\checkmark$         | 100        |
| Grodenchick  | 23       |                       |                         |                   |                     |                       |                          |                       |                      |                 |                 |                    |                      | N/A        |
| Lancman  | 24       | x                     | 1                       | ~                 | 1                   | ~                     | ~                        | 1                     | $\checkmark$         | x               | 1               | ~                  | $\checkmark$         | 80         |
| Dromm  | 25       | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$            | $\checkmark$      | A                   | A                     | $\checkmark$             | ~                     | $\checkmark$         | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$       | $\checkmark$         | 87         |
| Van Bramer   | 26       | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$            | $\checkmark$      | $\checkmark$        | ~                     | $\checkmark$             | ~                     | $\checkmark$         | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$       | $\checkmark$         | 100        |

| Key<br>✓ = pro-environment<br>X = anti-environment<br>A = absent<br>M = medical<br>* = priority bill | District | 1. Carryout Bag Bill* | 2. Child Safe Products* | 3. Microbead Ban* | 4. Park Maintenance | 5. Air Quality Survey | 6. Environmental Justice | 7. Geothermal Energy | 8. Clean Heating Oil | 9. Right of Way | 10. School Data | 11. LEED Standards    | 12. Solar Technology | 2015 SCORE |
|--|----------|-----------------------|-------------------------|-------------------|---------------------|-----------------------|--------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------------|----------------------|------------|
| Miller   | 27       | ~                     | $\checkmark$            | $\checkmark$      | ~                   | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$             | $\checkmark$         | x                    | ×               | $\checkmark$    | <ul> <li>✓</li> </ul> | $\checkmark$         | 87         |
| Wills  | 28       | ×                     | ~                       | x                 | м                   | м                     | x                        | $\checkmark$         | $\checkmark$         | x               | $\checkmark$    | x                     | х                    | 38         |
| Koslowitz  | 29       | ×                     | 1                       | $\checkmark$      | A                   | A                     | $\checkmark$             | $\checkmark$         | $\checkmark$         | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$    | x                     | $\checkmark$         | 67         |
| Crowley  | 30       | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$            | $\checkmark$      | $\checkmark$        | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$             | $\checkmark$         | $\checkmark$         | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$         | 100        |
| Richards   | 31       | ~                     | $\checkmark$            | $\checkmark$      | $\checkmark$        | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$             | $\checkmark$         | $\checkmark$         | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$         | 100        |
| Ulrich   | 32       | ×                     | x                       | $\checkmark$      | $\checkmark$        | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$             | $\checkmark$         | $\checkmark$         | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$         | 73         |
| Brooklyn   |          |                       |                         |                   |                     |                       |                          |                      |                      |                 |                 |                       |                      |            |
| Levin  | 33       | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$            | $\checkmark$      | $\checkmark$        | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$             | $\checkmark$         | $\checkmark$         | $\checkmark$    | ~               | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$         | 100        |
| Reynoso  | 34       | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$            | $\checkmark$      | $\checkmark$        | ~                     | $\checkmark$             | ~                    | ~                    | ~               | ~               | $\checkmark$          | х                    | 93         |
| Cumbo  | 35       | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$            | ×                 | $\checkmark$        | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$             | $\checkmark$         | x                    | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$          | х                    | 73         |
| Cornegy  | 36       | x                     | х                       | $\checkmark$      | $\checkmark$        | ~                     | $\checkmark$             | ~                    | ~                    | ~               | ~               | x                     | $\checkmark$         | 67         |
| Espinal  | 37       | х                     | х                       | $\checkmark$      | $\checkmark$        | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$             | $\checkmark$         | $\checkmark$         | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$         | 73         |
| Menchaca   | 38       | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$            | $\checkmark$      | $\checkmark$        | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$             | $\checkmark$         | $\checkmark$         | $\checkmark$    | ~               | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$         | 100        |
| Lander   | 39       | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$            | $\checkmark$      | $\checkmark$        | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$             | $\checkmark$         | ×                    | ×               | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$         | 87         |
| Eugene   | 40       | x                     | x                       | ×                 | $\checkmark$        | $\checkmark$          | ×                        | $\checkmark$         | x                    | ×               | $\checkmark$    | x                     | х                    | 27         |
| Mealy  | 41       | x                     | х                       | ×                 | $\checkmark$        | $\checkmark$          | ×                        | A                    | ×                    | ×               | $\checkmark$    | x                     | $\checkmark$         | 27         |
| Barron   | 42       | x                     | $\checkmark$            | $\checkmark$      | $\checkmark$        | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$             | $\checkmark$         | $\checkmark$         | $\checkmark$    | ~               | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$         | 87         |
| Gentile  | 43       | x                     | $\checkmark$            | ×                 | $\checkmark$        | $\checkmark$          | ×                        | $\checkmark$         | ×                    | ×               | $\checkmark$    | x                     | $\checkmark$         | 47         |
| Greenfield   | 44       | x                     | x                       | ×                 | $\checkmark$        | $\checkmark$          | ×                        | $\checkmark$         | x                    | ×               | ~               | x                     | х                    | 27         |
| Williams   | 45       | х                     | $\checkmark$            | $\checkmark$      | $\checkmark$        | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$             | A                    | $\checkmark$         | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$          | х                    | 73         |
| Maisel   | 46       | x                     | $\checkmark$            | $\checkmark$      | $\checkmark$        | ~                     | $\checkmark$             | ~                    | ~                    | ~               | ~               | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$         | 87         |
| Treyger  | 47       | х                     | $\checkmark$            | $\checkmark$      | $\checkmark$        | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$             | $\checkmark$         | $\checkmark$         | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$         | 87         |
| Deutsch  | 48       | x                     | $\checkmark$            | $\checkmark$      | ~                   | $\checkmark$          | $\checkmark$             | ~                    | ×                    | $\checkmark$    | $\checkmark$    | x                     | $\checkmark$         | 73         |
| Staten Island  |          |                       |                         |                   |                     |                       |                          |                      |                      |                 |                 |                       |                      |            |
| Rose   | 49       | x                     | $\checkmark$            | ~                 | ~                   | ~                     | ~                        | ~                    | $\checkmark$         | ~               | $\checkmark$    | \$\sqrt{1}\$          | $\checkmark$         | 87         |
| Matteo   | 50       | х                     | х                       | ×                 | ~                   | ~                     | ×                        | ~                    | x                    | ×               | $\checkmark$    | ×                     | х                    | 27         |
| Borelli  | 51       |                       |                         |                   |                     |                       |                          |                      |                      |                 |                 |                       |                      | N/A        |

# Electing for the Environment



# www.nylcv.org



facebook.com/nylcv



twitter.com/nylcv

© 2016 New York League of Conservation Voters, Inc.